

Analysis of the Implementation of Education and Training for State Civil Apparatus Employees at the Environmental and Forestry Training Center in Pekanbaru City

Dietia Cahyani Amran¹, Ikhwani Ratna^{2*}, Erlina³, Febby Krisna Mulya Putri⁴

^{1,2,3,4}Public Administration, Sultan Syarif State Islamic University, Pekanbaru, Indonesia

Email Correspondent
weni2783@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received Dec 22, 2025

Revised Dec 27, 2025

Accepted Jan 04, 2026

Available online Jan 09, 2026

Keywords:

Education and Training, ASN Employees, BLHK



This is an open access article under the [CC BY-SA](#) license.

Copyright © 2024 by Author.

Published by UIN Suska Riau

ABSTRACT

This study analyzes the implementation of education and training for State Civil Apparatus at the Pekanbaru City Environmental and Forestry Training Center. The study aims to identify the conditions of training implementation, its impact on improving employee competency, and the obstacles faced in its implementation. The research method uses a qualitative descriptive approach through in-depth interviews with employees within the Pekanbaru BPLHK environment. The results of the study indicate that three types of training are held, namely technical forestry training, functional training, and vocational training for the community. The training has been proven to have a positive impact on improving employee technical knowledge and skills, strengthening understanding of regulations, and increasing self-confidence in carrying out complex tasks. However, the implementation of the training faces significant obstacles such as limited infrastructure, budget constraints that hinder the frequency of implementation, weak post-training evaluation mechanisms, a curriculum that is not fully adaptive to current environmental issues, and low learning motivation of some participants. The results of the study conclude that the implementation of the training has been running but is not optimal, there is a gap between the ideal goals and the reality of implementation that requires systematic improvements through increased budget allocation, curriculum updates, improvements to infrastructure, and the development of a comprehensive evaluation system.

INTRODUCTION

The State Civil Apparatus (ASN) is the backbone of government administration and public services. ASN is required to not only carry out administrative functions but also act as agents of change capable of realizing good governance. In line with the mandate of Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning the State Civil Apparatus, ASN has an obligation to continuously develop competencies through continuous education and training (Sulistiyani & Rosidah, 2007). This competency development includes improving knowledge, skills, and work attitudes so that ASN is able to respond to increasingly complex national development challenges, including in the environmental and forestry sectors.

The training target for ASN is the realization of ASN who have competencies that are in accordance with the requirements of their respective positions and the function of the Training includes two functions at once, namely the educational function and the training function which are an inseparable whole (Handoko, 2010). Pre-service Training is the initial formation training for prospective Civil Servants regulated in LAN Regulation No. 10, 15, and 16 of 2015 where this training is aimed at building moral integrity, honesty, spirit and motivation of nationalism and nationality, superior and responsible personality character, and strengthening professionalism and field competence (Fara Merian Sari, 2018).

Within the framework of sustainable development, the environmental and forestry sectors occupy a very strategic position (Hasan, 2009). Pekanbaru City, as one of the centers of economic growth in Riau Province, faces various environmental issues, such as deforestation, forest and land fires (karhutla), air quality degradation, and pollution from urban and industrial activities. These issues require the presence of government officials, especially those under the Environment and Forestry Agency (BLHK), who have the technical capacity, integrity, and high professionalism in carrying out environmental management tasks (Moenir, 2007). Without competent civil servants, environmental policies and programs will be difficult to implement effectively.

Education and training (diklat) are important instruments in improving the competence of ASN in BLH (Notoatmojo, 2004). Through training, ASN is expected to not only gain conceptual understanding, but also practical skills relevant to problems in the field. Adaptive training curriculum, participatory learning methods, and competent facilitators are the main prerequisites for training to produce a real impact on improving ASN performance (Moekijat, 2008). There are three types of training at the Pekanbaru City Environmental and Forestry Training Center, namely: Forestry Technical Forestry Training for Civil Servants The Strategic Plan document states that there are five main areas of technical training: forest planning, forest utilization, forest and land rehabilitation & reclamation, forest protection & nature conservation, and forestry administration. For example: training on preparing Village Forest Management Plan (RPHD) documents for communities in village forest areas. Functional/functional position training Training for prospective officials and functional officials within the Ministry of Environment and Forestry of the Republic of Indonesia and regional forestry agencies. Related to the development of functional

position competencies such as environmental extension workers, forest ecosystem controllers. Training for the community or non-apparatus (vocational & forestry skills). There are programs targeting the general public or forest farmer groups to improve skills in the forestry sector and forestry-based economic empowerment (Dartha, 2010). Honeybee or sugar palm cultivation training by the Riau Province Environment and Forestry Service with the support of BDLHK Pekanbaru.

The implementation of training also serves as a means of developing the character of civil servants with integrity and a commitment to public service and environmental conservation (Rivai, 2006). However, in practice, the implementation of ASN education and training often faces various obstacles. From an institutional perspective, there are still limitations in training facilities and infrastructure, budget constraints, and weak post-training evaluation mechanisms that should be instruments for assessing program effectiveness (Simamora, 2008). From a substantive perspective, the curriculum has not fully adapted to current environmental issues, so the material provided is sometimes not contextual to field needs (Soebagio, 2009). Meanwhile, from the participant perspective, low learning motivation, mere formality of attendance, and minimal post-training follow-up often reduce the effectiveness of learning (Permana, 2015).

This situation indicates that there is still a gap between the ideal goals of civil servant education and training and the reality of implementation in the field (Rucky, 2007). Therefore, an in-depth analysis is needed regarding how training is implemented at the Pekanbaru City Environmental and Forestry Center, encompassing aspects of planning, implementation, and evaluation. This analysis is crucial not only for assessing the quality of the ongoing program but also for formulating recommendations for future improvements (Sugiyono, 2012).

Based on this background, it is hoped that a comprehensive overview of the supporting and inhibiting factors in the implementation of ASN education and training at the Pekanbaru Environmental and Forestry Agency (BLHK) will be obtained (Sjafri, 2011). Thus, the research findings can make a tangible contribution to improving the civil service competency development system, both at the local and national levels. Furthermore, this study is also relevant as an effort to support the achievement of sustainable development goals (SDGs), particularly in the environmental and institutional governance aspects (Sule & Saefullah, 2010).

LITERATURE REVIEW

Human Resources

In human resource studies, various theories can be used to explain the importance of education and training for civil servants. According to Hasibuan (2019), human resource management is the science and art of managing relationships and the roles of the workforce effectively and efficiently in helping to achieve organizational, employee, and societal goals. Meanwhile, Dessler (2015) explains that human resource management is a set of policies and practices that encompass recruitment, training, assessment, compensation, and employee development. Furthermore, Rivai (2014) emphasizes that human resource development is the process of improving the

technical, theoretical, conceptual, and moral abilities of employees according to the needs of the position and the organization. Quality human resources are the basic capital in managing information technology, which influences institutional performance. Quality resources are obtained through the development of human resources by the organization itself through its own plans.

Human resource development can be achieved through formal and non-formal education, such as through job training and workplace development, the application of learning within organizations, and competency-based development (Ruhana, 2012). Human resource quality is the ability of employees to carry out their duties in providing services to the community, as seen from their skills, educational background, and professionalism in carrying out their duties.

Human Resources Indicators According to Experts

According to Werther & Davis (1996), HR encompasses planning, organizing, directing, and supervising the procurement, development, compensation, integration, maintenance, and termination of employee employment to achieve individual, organizational, and societal goals. Meanwhile, according to Hasibuan (2019), HR is the integrated ability of an individual's mental and physical abilities, acquired through education, experience, and training, used to achieve specific goals. (Hasibuan 2019). HR indicators according to experts:

According to Sondang P. Siagian (2018) in his book "Human Resource Management," the quality of human resources in an organization can be seen from several indicators that demonstrate individual performance and work behavior. Siagian emphasized that human resources are not only measured by the number of employees, but also by their quality and contribution to achieving organizational goals. The following are various human resource indicators according to Sondang P. Siagian:

Quality of Work. Work quality reflects an employee's ability to produce work that meets organizational standards, including accuracy, timeliness, and a minimum error rate. According to Siagian, work quality is determined by an employee's level of competence in their field, understanding of their core duties and job functions, and readiness to handle complex work.

Work Discipline. Siagian emphasized that discipline is a form of loyalty and responsibility towards the organization. Work discipline means a person's desire to comply with work regulations, procedures, and norms without being pressured by external parties. According to Siagian, indicators of discipline can be seen from punctuality in arriving and leaving work, obedience to superiors' orders, responsibility in completing tasks on time, and not violating work regulations. In the context of civil servants (ASN), discipline is crucial because it is directly related to bureaucratic professionalism. Disciplined ASN will serve as role models, maintain public service ethics, and support the formation of a clean and effective government.

Initiative and Responsibility. According to Siagian, a quality workforce doesn't just wait for instructions, but can also take the initiative to do tasks beyond what is assigned. Initiative demonstrates the ability to think creatively and a passion for contributing to the organization. Characteristics of people who have initiative and

responsibility include the ability to identify problems and find solutions without waiting for instructions, the courage to make rational decisions for the well-being of the organization, and the willingness to take responsibility for the results of their work. For example, in a training institution, employees who take the initiative can develop new training methods, improve administrative systems, or propose innovative ideas to increase program effectiveness. Siagian emphasized that initiative and responsibility are key markers that separate great workers from ordinary ones.

Cooperation and Communication. This indicator relates to a person's ability to work in a team and communicate effectively with coworkers, superiors, or external parties. According to Siagian, good cooperation and communication can increase organizational efficiency and effectiveness, reduce conflict and misunderstandings between employees, and foster a harmonious work environment.

Creativity and Adaptability. Creativity is the ability to generate new ideas that benefit the organization, while adaptability demonstrates a person's flexibility in dealing with changes in the work environment. Siagian explained that modern organizations require employees who are innovative in solving problems, able to learn from experience and adapt to new challenges. In training institutions, creativity can be seen in how employees develop more engaging learning methods, create interactive training media, or find new approaches to managing trainees.

Education and Training

Education and training (diklat) are essentially important instruments in human resource development. According to Sikula (1976), training is a short-term educational process carried out systematically so that employees acquire technical knowledge and skills for specific purposes. This view is reinforced by Mangkunegara (2017), who stated that diklat is a planned process to improve employee capabilities in both technical and managerial aspects. Rivai (2014) added that education and training aim to improve the technical, theoretical, conceptual, and moral abilities of employees so that they are able to carry out tasks according to organizational demands. Within the regulatory framework, Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning the State Civil Apparatus emphasizes that ASN competency development is carried out through education and training, seminars, courses, and briefings, as a right of every ASN to improve professionalism in public service. Thus, diklat can be understood as a structured educational process that not only improves technical skills but also strengthens the attitude and commitment of civil servants in carrying out government duties and public service.

Besides education and training, improving work quality (performance quality) in the use of information technology can also be achieved by providing incentives or bonuses. This aims to increase work efficiency and effectiveness (Bitner & Zeithaml in Riorini, 2004). According to Nasution (1994), incentive programs are aimed at motivating employees to work more optimally. These incentives can be divided into two types, namely: (1) financial, in the form of salaries, bonuses, or similar forms of awards provided by the company, and (2) non-financial, in the form of facilities that support work comfort such as recreational activities, cafeterias, and places of worship

(Husen, 1999). Human resource (HR) development is a primary need for organizations to be able to face future challenges, increase professionalism, and achieve sustainable productivity.

Human resources are a strategic asset of an organization, not only serving as policy implementers but also as the primary driver in achieving the organization's vision and mission. Therefore, education and training for employees, both new and existing, are crucial to enhance their knowledge, particularly in mastering the ever-evolving information technology. With qualified human resources, work can be carried out more intelligently, effectively, and efficiently. Training must provide tangible benefits, not only for information technology managers but also for all employees and village staff. This ensures that the improvement of abilities and skills is truly aligned with each individual's functions and responsibilities. Ivancevich (2008) states that training is a systematic process aimed at changing individual behavior to improve organizational performance. Training is typically oriented toward current needs, particularly in mastering specific skills and competencies that support job success. Thus, training can create systematic changes in individual skills, attitudes, and behaviors so that organizational goals can be effectively achieved. The success or failure of an organization's efficiency and effectiveness depends heavily on the quality of its human resource development. Organizations must be able to provide optimal education and training programs to maximize the potential of its human resources.

METHODOLOGY

This type of research is descriptive research using a qualitative descriptive approach, aiming to provide an overview of a particular phenomenon/society. Qualitative research is an approach that reveals a particular social situation by describing reality correctly, formed by words based on relevant data collection and analysis techniques obtained from natural situations. Djam'an Satori and Aan Komariah (2012:39). This research was conducted by the author at the Pekanbaru City Regional Secretariat Office. The reason is, there are indications or phenomena that the implementation of education and training (diklat) for State Civil Apparatus (ASN) employees in the Pekanbaru City Regional Secretariat environment is not running optimally.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Interviews with several employees at the Pekanbaru City Environmental and Forestry Training Center (BPLHK) revealed the current state of education and training for civil servants. The informants explained that education and training at their institution play a highly strategic role, given the increasingly complex challenges of environmental and forestry management in the Riau region. Issues ranging from forest and land fires and deforestation to environmental pollution caused by industrial activity demand highly competent technical personnel.

An employee who has worked for more than ten years explained that the Pekanbaru BPLHK holds three main types of training. The first is technical forestry training for civil servants, covering five main areas: forest planning, forest utilization,

forest and land rehabilitation and reclamation, forest protection and nature conservation, and forestry administration. For example, they once held training on preparing Village Forest Management Plan documents for communities in village forest areas. The second is functional or functional position training aimed at prospective officials and functional officials within the Ministry of Environment and Forestry and regional forestry agencies, such as environmental extension workers and forest ecosystem controllers. The third is training for the community or non-civil servants that is vocational and forestry skills, for example training on honeybee or sugar palm cultivation conducted with the support of the Riau Provincial Environment and Forestry Service.

Regarding the quality of employee work after participating in the training, most informants acknowledged significant improvements. They felt more confident in completing technical tasks that were previously considered complex. One staff member who had recently participated in forest planning training stated that the material provided was highly applicable and could be immediately applied in the field. However, he added that not all training materials were always up-to-date with current environmental issues. They found several times that the curriculum used was still based on conditions from several years ago, making it less relevant to the dynamics of current issues.

In terms of work discipline, employees acknowledged that the work culture at BPLHK is quite good. Punctuality in attendance and completion of tasks are maintained together. However, when asked further about attendance at training, several informants revealed concerns. It's not uncommon for training participants to attend merely for the sake of formality, taking attendance but not actively engaging in the learning process. One senior employee explained that some participants' motivation to learn is still low. Some view training as merely an administrative obligation, rather than an opportunity for personal development. This situation significantly impacts the overall effectiveness of the training.

Regarding initiative and responsibility, some employees demonstrate a proactive attitude. They don't simply wait for instructions from their superiors but also strive to find solutions to problems that arise in their daily work. An employee in the training administration department described how she tried to develop a digital participant registration system to streamline the administrative process. This initiative was appreciated by her superiors, although not all employees shared this enthusiasm. Some tended to be passive, simply carrying out their assignments without attempting to innovate.

In terms of cooperation and communication, the work environment at BPLHK is considered quite conducive. Employees support each other in completing collaborative tasks, particularly during training sessions involving multiple parties. Coordination between departments is also good, although occasional miscommunications arise due to differing understandings of work procedures. A lecturer explained that communicating with training participants is also a challenge, particularly when having to convey complex technical material to participants with diverse educational backgrounds.

However, despite these positive efforts, the implementation of training at the Pekanbaru BPLHK still faces a number of serious obstacles. One of the main issues complained about by almost all informants is the limited training facilities and infrastructure. Available classrooms are sometimes inadequate to accommodate the large number of participants, making the learning process less comfortable. Supporting equipment such as LCD projectors and sound systems also frequently break down, disrupting the smooth delivery of material. An employee in the facilities and infrastructure department admitted that they had submitted proposals for new equipment several times, but were hampered by budget constraints.

Budget constraints are a recurring problem. Several much-needed training programs have had to be postponed or even canceled due to insufficient funding. This has resulted in suboptimal training frequency. A structural official explained that they must be highly selective in prioritizing training programs. As a result, not all employees receive equal opportunities to participate in training tailored to their competency development needs.

Another equally important issue is the weak post-training evaluation mechanism. Several informants stated that after attending training, there was no systematic follow-up to measure the extent to which the training had improved their performance. Evaluations typically consisted of completing a participant satisfaction form at the end of the training, with no further measurement of how the knowledge gained was applied to their daily work. An employee who had served on a training committee revealed that they recognized the importance of comprehensive evaluations, but were hampered by the lack of standardized evaluation instruments and competent human resources to conduct such assessments.

In terms of content, several training participants felt that the curriculum wasn't fully responsive to current environmental issues. For example, material on climate change and the use of digital technology in forest management was still very limited. Yet, in today's digital age, mastery of information technology is a pressing need. One young employee suggested that the training curriculum be updated more frequently by involving practitioners and academics with a deep understanding of current developments in forestry and environmental science.

Nevertheless, it cannot be denied that training still provides tangible benefits for employee competency development. Many employees feel that their knowledge and skills have improved after participating in the training. They have a better understanding of the latest regulations, more effective forest management techniques, and ways to communicate with communities in empowerment programs. Several employees also mentioned that the training provides an opportunity to connect and share experiences with colleagues from other agencies, broadening their horizons and professional networks.

Overall, the implementation of civil servant education and training at the Pekanbaru BPLHK (National Agency for the Environment and Forestry), can be said to be ongoing, but not yet optimal. There is still a gap between the ideal goals and the reality on the ground. To improve the effectiveness of training, a strong commitment from leadership is needed to improve infrastructure, increase budget allocation,

develop a more adaptive curriculum, and establish a comprehensive evaluation system. Furthermore, efforts are needed to increase employee motivation and awareness of the importance of continuous competency development. With these improvements, it is hoped that training can truly be an effective instrument in creating professional, competent, and integrity-based civil servants, who will ultimately be able to support sustainable environmental and forestry management in the Riau region.

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of research on the implementation of education and training for State Civil Apparatus at the Pekanbaru City Environmental and Forestry Training Center, it can be concluded that the training program held has a strategic role in developing employee competencies, however, its implementation still faces various challenges that hinder the achievement of optimal goals. There are three types of training held: technical forestry training for civil servants, functional training or functional positions, and vocational and skills training for the general public. These three types of training are designed to address the diverse competency needs in environmental and forestry management.

From a human resource quality perspective, the training program has been shown to have a positive impact on improving employee knowledge and technical skills. Participants felt more confident in performing complex tasks and had a better understanding of regulations and effective environmental management techniques. Work discipline within the Pekanbaru BPLHK (Regional Environmental Management Agency) also demonstrated good performance, with well-maintained attendance and punctuality. However, learning motivation remains a challenge for some participants, with many attending the training merely as an administrative formality without actively participating in the learning process.

In terms of initiative and responsibility, there is significant variation among employees. Some employees demonstrate a proactive attitude by developing innovations in work systems and seeking solutions to emerging problems. Cooperation and communication among employees also run smoothly, creating a work environment conducive to collaboration. However, some employees still tend to be passive, simply awaiting instructions without taking the initiative to contribute more.

The main obstacles faced in implementing training encompass three fundamental aspects. First, limited training facilities and infrastructure are inadequate to support an optimal learning process. Uncomfortable classrooms and frequently damaged supporting equipment disrupt the smooth delivery of material. Second, budget constraints result in suboptimal training frequency and not all employees receiving equal opportunities to participate in training as needed. Third, weak post-training evaluation mechanisms result in the lack of systematic measurement of the training's impact on improving employee performance in the field.

In terms of content, the existing training curriculum is not fully adaptive to current environmental issues. The material presented is sometimes out of context with field needs and the increasingly rapid development of information technology. This

highlights the need for regular curriculum updates, involving practitioners and academics with a deep understanding of the dynamics of contemporary environmental and forestry issues.

Despite these challenges, education and training remain crucial tools and provide tangible benefits for civil servant competency development. Training not only enhances technical capacity but also serves as a platform for building professional networks and sharing experiences among employees from various agencies. Therefore, it can be concluded that the implementation of civil servant training at the Pekanbaru BPLHK (National Agency for the Environment and Forestry), although not yet optimal, remains significant. There is still a gap between the ideal goals and the reality of implementation on the ground, which requires systematic and sustainable improvement.

REFERENCES

Ambar, T., Sulistiyan & Rosidah. 2007. Human Resource Management: Concepts, Theories, and Development in the Context of Public Organizations. Graha Ilmu. Yogyakarta.

Amin, Widjaja Tunggal. 2005. Internal Auditing. Fifth Edition. Yogyakarta: BPFE.

Arikunto, Suharsimi, 2006. Research Methods: Research Procedures: A Practical Approach, Rineka Cipta, Jakarta.

Caprara, G. V., & Zimbardo, P. G. (2004). Personalizing politics: A congruency model of political preferences. In American Psychologist. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0003-066X.59.7.581>

Dartha, IK (2010). The Influence of Education and Training (Diklat) on the Performance of Civil Servants at the Regional Secretariat of Malang City. Journal of Modernization Economics, 6(2). Kanjuruhan University, Malang.

Diener, E. (2000). Subjective well-being: The science of happiness and a proposal for a national index. American Psychologist. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0003-066X.55.1.34>

Every supporting study is here and follows the APA 7th Referencing Guide. We strongly advise you to use referencing tools like Mendeley or Zotero. Write your references as follows:

Haerani, S., Parmitasari, RDA, Aponno, EH, & Aunalal, ZI (2019). Moderating effects of age on personality, driving behavior towards driving outcomes. International Journal of Human Rights in Healthcare. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJHRH-08-2017-0040>

Handoko, TH (2010). Personnel and Human Resource Management (Second Edition). BPFE. Yogyakarta.

Handoko, T., Hani. 2010. Personnel and Human Resource Management. Second Edition. BPFE. Yogyakarta.

Hasan, M. (2009). Organization and Management. Kaunika. Jakarta.

Hasan, M, 2009. Organization and Management. Kaunika. Jakarta.

I Ketut Dartha. 2010. The Influence of Education and Training (Diklat) on the Performance of Civil Servants at the Regional Secretariat of Malang City. Journal of Modernized Economics Vol. 6, No. 2. Kanjuruhan University, Malang.

Ignatius, Wursanto. 2006. Secretary Competence. Yogyakarta.

Iman, Permana. 2015. The Relationship between Education and Training and the Competence of Employees at the Kampar Regency Education and Culture Office. *Jom FEKON* Vol. 2 No. 1. University of Riau.

Milkovich, Marthis and Jackson, John H., 2005. *Human Resource Management*. Salemba Empat. Jakarta.

Moekijat. (2008). *Evaluation of Training in the Context of Increasing Productivity*. Mandar Maju. Bandung.

Moekijat. 2008. *Training Evaluation in the Context of Increasing Productivity*. Bandung: Mandar Maju.

Moenir, HAS (2007). *Public Service Management in Indonesia*. Bumi Aksara. Jakarta.

Moenir, HAS 2007. *Public Service Management in Indonesia*. Bumi Askara. Jakarta.

Notoatmojo, S. (2004). *Human Resource Development*. PT. Rineka Cipta. Jakarta.

Notoatmojo, Soekidjo. 2004. *Human Resource Development*. PT. Rineka Cipta. Jakarta.

Permana, I. (2015). The Relationship between Education and Training and the Competence of Employees at the Kampar Regency Education and Culture Office. *Jom FEKON*, 2(1). University of Riau.

Rivai, V. (2006). *Human Resource Management for Companies: From Theory to Practice*. PT Raja Grafindo Persada. Jakarta.

Rivai, Veithzal. 2006. *Human Resource Management for Companies: From Theory to Practice*. PT Raja Grafindo Persada. Jakarta.

Rucky, AS (2007). *Job Performance Assessment; Theory and Practice*. PT. Karya Uni Press. Jakarta.

Rucky, Achmad S. 2007. *Job Performance Assessment; Theory and Practice*. PT. Karya Uni Press. Jakarta.

Sayuti, Moh. Yakub. 2005. *Human Resource Development*. Gaya Media Pratama. Jakarta.

Simamora, H. (2008). *Human Resource Management*. STIE YKPN. Yogyakarta.

Simamora, H. 2008. *Human Resource Management*. STIE YKPN. Yogyakarta.

Sulistiyani, Ambar Tegun, 2008. *Human Resource Management: Concept, Theory, and Development in the Context of Public Organizations*. Geraha Ilmu. Yogyakarta.

Simanjuntak, 2005. *Performance Management and Evaluation*. Publishing Institution of the Faculty of Economics, University of Indonesia: Jakarta.

Siswanto, Sastrohadiwiryo. 2006. *Indonesian Workforce Management*. PT. Bumi Aksara. Jakarta.

Sjafri, M. (2011). *Strategic Human Resource Management*. Ghalia Indonesia. Jakarta.

Sjafri, Mangkuprawira. 2011. *Strategic Human Resource Management*. Ghalia Indonesia. Jakarta.

Soebagio, A. (2009). *Training Management*. Balai Pustaka. Jakarta.

Soebagio, Atmodiwiyo. 2009. *Training Management*. Balai Pustaka. Jakarta.

Soeroto, Wahjo., 2005. *Compensation and Motivation*. PT. Ghalia Indonesia. Jakarta.

Sugiyono. (2012). *Qualitative Quantitative Research Methods and R&D*. Alfabeta. Bandung.

Sugiyono. 2012. *Qualitative Quantitative Research Methods and R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta.

Sule, ET, & Saefullah, K. (2010). *Introduction to Management* (1st Edition). Kencana Prenada Media Group. Jakarta. ISBN: 979-3456-75-1.

Sule, ET, and Saefullah, K. 2010. *Introduction to Management*. 1st Edition. Jakarta: Kencana Predana Media Group. ISBN:979-3456-75-1.

Sulistiyani, AT, & Rosidah. (2007). Human Resource Management: Concepts, Theories, and Development in the Context of Public Organizations. Graha Ilmu. Yogyakarta.

Susilo, S. Martoyo. 2005. Understanding Qualitative Research. Alfabeta. Bandung.

Tengku, Annisa. 2015. The Influence of Education, Training, and Motivation on Employee Performance at the Cooperatives and Small and Medium Enterprises Office of Riau Province. Jom FEKON Vol. 2 No. 1. University of Riau.